



Office of the County Clerk

Angie Waters, Clerk/Register of Deeds

Kimberly Bennett, Chief Deputy

Cara DenUyl, Elections Manager

201 McMorran Blvd., Room 1100
Port Huron, Michigan 48060

Web: www.stclaircountyclerk.org

Elections Division

Phone: 810-985-2159

Fax: 810-985-2241

Email: elections@st.claircounty.org

ST. CLAIR COUNTY ELECTION COMMISSION MINUTES OF RECALL PETITION CLARITY HEARING

201 McMorran Boulevard
Room 2700
Port Huron, Michigan 48060

Date and Time of Meeting:

January 09, 2026, at 1:30 p.m.

Subject of Recall Petitions:

- **Brad Smith**, Columbus Township Supervisor
- **Angie Biringer**, Columbus Township Clerk
- **Jared Greenia**, Columbus Township Trustee

Present:

- Judge John Tomlinson
- Treasurer Kelly Roberts-Burnett
- Clerk/Register Angie Waters
- Elections Manager Cara DenUyl
- Members of the public

Call to Order:

The hearing was called to order by Judge Tomlinson at 1:35 p.m.

Roll Call:

All present

Approval of Meeting Minutes from December 23, 2025:

Motion to approve was made by Roberts-Burnett and seconded by Waters. All approved, motion carried.

Public Comment:

Angie Biringer, Columbus Township Clerk- stated she believed the action was retaliatory and that the accusations against her were false. She expressed support for actions taken by Trustee Greenia, and refuted claims against Supervisor Smith.

Jennifer Andersen, Casco Township Clerk – Described a positive working relationship with Columbus Township Clerk Angie Biringer.

Michael Spanich, Former Columbus Township Office Administrator – Discussed working relationships with the Clerk and Supervisor and referenced a prior case involving the parties. He described what he characterized as a toxic work environment.

Jared Greenia, Columbus Township Trustee – Stated that he did not believe the petition language was factual or clear. Expressed support for the township Clerk Biringer.

Roland Suess - Expressed support for the Clerk Biringer.

Dave Hetzel, sponsor of recall petitions – Alleged resident intimidation and poor management, and discussed accounts of alleged misconduct involving the clerk, supervisor and Trustee Greenia.

Pheobe Duncan, former Columbus Township Treasurer – Spoke of a positive 12-year working relationship with the Clerk Biringer.

Brad Smith, Columbus Township Supervisor – Addressed multiple allegations of misconduct in his own defense.

Kim Hetzel- Columbus Township Treasurer – Discussed alleged issues with the Supervisor and raised concerns about meeting procedures.

Tony Baczewski – Resident of Columbus Township – Expressed dissatisfaction with the Supervisor, Clerk, and Trustee Greenia.

Commission Discussion and Determinations:

Tomlinson discussed that the responsibility of the Election Commission is to determine if there is a basis of fact in the language, not to determine the truth or falsity of the statements. Language should be clear enough for both the officer and voters to understand the wording on the petition.

Recall Petition: Brad Smith – “Road Commission” Language

Tomlinson stated that he felt the language lacked adequate detail to make its meaning clear and would benefit from the inclusion of an example. Waters stated that language was not clear and to avoid the use of subjective terms, such as *misuse* or *deliberately*. Roberts-Burnett agreed.

Result: The clarity of the petition language was rejected by a 3-0 vote.

Recall Petition: Brad Smith – “Open Meetings Act” Language

Tomlinson stated that the first sentence, when considered independently, may be sufficiently clear. The second sentence, however, is overly broad and lacks sufficient detail to allow an officer or voter to determine its accuracy. Roberts-Burnett agreed.

Result: The clarity of the petition language was rejected by a 3-0 vote.

Recall Petition: Angie Biringer – “Road Commission” Language

Tomlinson stated that the language is overly broad and lacks sufficient detail to clearly convey its meaning. It would benefit from the inclusion of the specific error that occurred. Care should be taken to avoid the use of subjective terms, such as *deliberately*. Waters agreed.

Result: The clarity of the petition language was rejected by a 3-0 vote.

Recall Petition: Angie Biringer – “FOIA” Language

Tomlinson stated that language contained a substantial amount of information; however, the items were stated too broadly. Providing examples would have helped to clarify the language. Roberts-Burnett agreed.

Result: The clarity of the petition language was rejected by a 3-0 vote.

Recall Petition: Jared Greenia

Tomlinson expressed concern with the first sentence, stating that its meaning was not clear considering the public discussion and that an example would be helpful for clarity. Tomlinson also noted that the second sentence lacks sufficient detail to understand what “decision” is being referenced or whether it is asserting that a law was violated. Waters agreed.

Result: The clarity of the petition language was rejected by a 3-0 vote.

Adjournment:

Motion to adjourn the Clarity Hearing was made by Waters and seconded by Roberts-Burnett. The meeting was adjourned without objections at 2:29 p.m.

St Clair County Election Commission Chair

Date Approved on